

## Towards a revised coefficient for estimating N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from legumes

Philippe Rochette<sup>1,\*</sup> and H. Henry Janzen<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2560, Boul. Hochelaga, Sainte-Foy, Québec, Canada, G1V 2J3;

<sup>2</sup>Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 5403 - 1st Avenue, P.O. Box 3000, Lethbridge, Alberta, Canada, T1J 4B1; \*Author for correspondence (e-mail: janzen@agr.gc.ca)

Received 4 January 2005; accepted in revised form 20 June 2005

**Key words:** Biological N fixation, greenhouse gases, IPCC, Nitrous oxide, *Rhizobium*

### Abstract

The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) standard methodology to conduct national inventories of soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions is based on default (or Tier I) emission factors for various sources. The objective of our study was to summarize recent N<sub>2</sub>O flux data from agricultural legume crops to assess the emission factor associated with rhizobial nitrogen fixation. Average N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from legumes are 1.0 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> for annual crops, 1.8 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> for pure forage crops and 0.4 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> for grass-legume mixes. These values are only slightly greater than background emissions from agricultural crops and are much lower than those predicted using 1996 IPCC methodology. These field flux measurements and other process-level studies offer little support for the use of an emission factor for biological N fixation (BNF) by legume crops equal to that for fertiliser N. We conclude that much of the increase in soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions in legume crops may be attributable to the N release from root exudates during the growing season and from decomposition of crop residues after harvest, rather than from BNF *per se*. Consequently, we propose that the biological fixation process itself be removed from the IPCC N<sub>2</sub>O inventory methodology, and that N<sub>2</sub>O emissions induced by the growth of legume crops be estimated solely as a function of crop residue decomposition using an estimate of above- and below-ground residue inputs, modified as necessary to reflect recent findings on N allocation.

### Introduction

International initiatives such as the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Kyoto Protocol require countries to calculate national inventories of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. In 1996, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) proposed a standard methodology to conduct inventories of GHG emissions from various sectors of human activity (IPCC 1997). This procedure included default (or Tier I) emission factors for N<sub>2</sub>O sources in agricultural soils such as application of

nitrogen fertilizer or animal manure, decomposition of crop residues and biological nitrogen fixation (BNF). New studies published since 1996 may allow modifications of the IPCC methodology, notably of the BNF emission factor.

About 30–40 million tonnes of atmospheric N<sub>2</sub> are fixed every year by bacteria in symbiosis with legume crops (Jenkinson 2001; Smil 2002a, b; Galloway et al. 2003). According to the current IPCC methodology, this nitrogen (N) can produce N<sub>2</sub>O in two ways: N<sub>2</sub>O can be produced during biological N fixation itself, and N<sub>2</sub>O can be produced when legume residues are returned to the

soil. The latter route is well-established – when residues rich in N (low C:N ratio) decompose in soil, they can release large amounts of mineral N which is then susceptible to  $N_2O$  loss during nitrification and denitrification (Aoyama and Nozawa 1993; Larsson et al. 1998; Baggs et al. 2000; Yang et al. 2002; Huang et al. 2004; Rochette et al. 2004). Accordingly, incorporating legume residues can result in higher  $N_2O$ -N losses than those from non-legume residues (e.g., Millar et al. 2004).

Clearly, legumes can produce substantial  $N_2O$  when their residues decompose. But emissions from the other pathway – during fixation itself – seem less certain. Some studies have shown that several *Rhizobium* species, in the free-living form, in legume root nodules or as isolated bacteroids, can denitrify nitrate and release  $N_2O$  (O'Hara et al. 1984; Bryan et al. 1985; O'Hara and Daniel 1985; van Berkum and Keyser 1985; Smith and Smith 1986; Bonish et al. 1991; Garcia-Plazaola et al. 1993a; Garcia-Plazaola et al. 1996; Rosen et al. 1996). This denitrification may have several benefits for *Rhizobia*. It eliminates nitrate that inhibits nitrogenase activity in nodules (Luciński et al. 2002) and nitrite that prevents Rhizobial infection of legume roots (Munns 1977). Denitrification also removes toxic nitrite and may supply energy during nitrate respiration (O'Hara and Daniel 1985; Arrese-Igor et al. 1990; Garcia-Plazaola et al. 1993a). Some strains of *Rhizobium* can reduce  $NO_3^-$  completely to  $N_2$  but the end product of the most active denitrifying *Rhizobia* seems to be  $N_2O$  (O'Hara and Daniel 1985).

While studies have shown that some *Rhizobia* can denitrify nitrate, the rate at which this process occurs seems to vary, depending on species. For example, Rosen et al. (1996) "found a great variety regarding the denitrification capacity within *R. meliloti* strains, most of them with low or no detectable activity." Furthermore, the significance of *Rhizobia* denitrification in the field is still debated (Breitenbeck and Bremner 1989; Luciński et al. 2002). O'Hara and Daniel (1985) suggested that rhizobial "denitrification can occur in normally-aerated soil" and that "On an area basis, the nitrogen losses are similar in magnitude to the nitrogen gained by symbiotic rhizobial nitrogen fixation, even when soil numbers of rhizobial are quite moderate". In contrast, Garcia-Plazaola et al. (1993b) concluded more recently that "even with optimal conditions for denitrification and the

highest rhizobial populations found in agricultural soils, the contribution of *Rhizobium* to the total denitrification was virtually negligible as compared to other soil microorganisms". Similarly, Breitenbeck and Bremner (1989) observed that free-living cells of soybean rhizobia (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum*) can denitrify nitrate under anaerobic conditions but concluded that the population of these bacteria is likely too small to influence the rate of denitrification in soils. This brief literature review suggests that the significance of  $N_2O$  emission from legumes during N fixation remains uncertain and unproven.

When the IPCC  $N_2O$  emissions factors were first established, there were few field data quantifying  $N_2O$  emissions from biological N fixation. Duxbury et al. (1982) had reported relatively high cumulative fluxes of 2.3 and 4.2 kg N  $ha^{-1}$  year $^{-1}$  for an alfalfa field while Bremner et al. (1980) had measured lower emissions in soybean (0.3–2.0 kg N  $ha^{-1}$  year $^{-1}$ ). Based on these data and reports of high denitrification rates by *Rhizobia* (O'Hara and Daniel 1985), the IPCC emission factor for BNF was estimated at 1.25% of fixed N (IPCC 1997). Since then, field studies have added new information on  $N_2O$  emissions from legumes. Bouwman et al. (2002a), in an exhaustive summary of  $N_2O$  emissions from agricultural fields, reported that emissions from legume crops were 37% greater (though not significant statistically) than emissions from upland crops. Many of the legume fields in which the emission measurements were made also received N amendments. In the absence of non-legume controls, total  $N_2O$  fluxes often also included contributions from crop residue decomposition and other soil background sources. Consequently, Bouwman et al. (2002b) acknowledged the difficulties in assessing the contribution of BNF to  $N_2O$  emissions. Velthof and Oenema (1997) and Velthof et al. (1998) estimated  $N_2O$ -N emissions from grass-clover systems to vary between 0 and 1% of biologically-fixed  $N_2$ , probably lower than from an equivalent amount of N fertilizer because the biologically-fixed N is released slowly into the soil. This is in agreement with Corre et al. (1996) who observed that  $N_2O$  emissions from a seeded alfalfa pasture were lowest among all agricultural situations investigated in the semiarid Canadian Prairies.

Our objective was to summarize recent  $N_2O$  fluxes data from agricultural legume crops to as-

sess the emission factor associated with rhizobial nitrogen fixation.

## Material and methods

We compiled from the literature pertinent field measurements of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions in legume crops. Nitrous oxide emissions were defined as the cumulative flux reported for one field treatment during individual annual periods covered by a study (24 to 365 days). The measurements were obtained from various sources:

1. Bouwman et al. (2002a), an extensive list of flux and ancillary data from field studies published prior to 2000;
2. Additional references published before 2000 but not included in Bouwman et al. (2002a).
3. Studies published after 1999.
4. Unpublished data from Canadian studies summarized by Helgason et al. (2005).

When possible, only  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions during the growing season of the legume crops were cumulated to minimize confounding effects of residue decomposition on total emissions. However, most data sets did not separate fluxes by season, so cumulative fluxes likely include emissions that occurred prior to planting and after harvest or termination of the crop, especially for annual crops. Data from individual studies were then grouped by crop type (pure legume forage stands, grass-legume mixes and annual legumes) and further divided into unfertilized and fertilized (mineral or organic) groups. ‘Unfertilized’ situations included annual legumes where a small amount of N ( $\leq 5 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$ ) was applied at planting.

## Results

Our data set included 79 measurements from 33 studies (Table 1). Among unfertilized situations, there were more measurements from annual crops (41) than from pure legume forage (17) or grass-legume forage mixes (5). The fertilized legume crops involved mostly grass-legume forage mixes (11) and very few annual (2) and forage (3) legumes.

Among situations that were not fertilized, mean cumulative annual  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions were highest in pure legume forage crops ( $1.8 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$ ), intermediate in annual crops ( $1.0 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$ ) and lowest in grass-legume forages mixes ( $0.4 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$ ) (Table 1a, b, c). Emissions in legume fields fertilized with organic or mineral N sources averaged  $1.5 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$ . Variability between measurements was large as indicated by coefficients of variation  $\geq 75\%$ .

## Discussion

Annual  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions associated with BNF in legume crops are typically of the order of several  $\text{kg N ha}^{-1}$  when estimated using the IPCC emission methodology (1.25% of fixed N). Using this approach, for example, Rochette et al. (2004) calculated BNF IPCC estimates ranging from 4.7 to  $5.2 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  for second- or third-year alfalfa and between 3.2 and  $5.0 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  for soybean. Measured  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions summarized in Table 1 a, b and c are considerably lower than these IPCC estimates. Moreover, differences between measured and IPCC-derived  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions attributed to BNF are likely even greater if we consider that field measurements also included  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  from sources other than BNF, such as the turnover of soil organic matter and crop residue. Emissions originating from sources other than fertilizer N (so-called “background” emissions) were estimated in agricultural fields to be  $0.405 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  (Helgason et al. 2005),  $0.82 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  (Gregorich et al. 2005) and  $1 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  (Bouwman 1996). That these background emissions are of magnitude similar to fluxes reported in several annual legume crops suggests that emissions measured in legumes can be attributed largely to sources other than BNF itself. Consequently, the annual  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions derived directly from BNF itself are (1) likely less than the values reported in Table 1, and (2) much smaller than estimates obtained using the IPCC Tier I methodology.

Bolstering this observation from field flux measurements are some recent findings from process-level laboratory studies. For example, Thyme and Ambus (2004) observed that under white clover grown in an  $^{15}\text{N}_2$ -enriched atmosphere, only between 0 and 2% of the total  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions originated from recently-fixed  $\text{N}_2$ . Zhong et al.

Table 1. Summary of N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from agricultural legume crops (adapted from Bouwman et al. 2002a).

<i>A- Pure legume forage stands</i>							
Reference	Location	Crop	<sup>c</sup> Fertilizer type	N-rate (kg N ha <sup>-1</sup> )	N <sub>2</sub> O emission (kg N ha <sup>-1</sup> )	Length of exp. (d)	<sup>b</sup> Method <sup>c</sup> Freq.
Duxbury et al. (1982)	New York, USA	Alfalfa		0	2.3	365	c d
Duxbury et al. (1982)	New York, USA	Alfalfa		0	4.2	365	c d
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Alfalfa			2		c
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Alfalfa			2.83		c
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Alfalfa			4.57		c
Robertson et al. (2000)	East Lansing, USA	Alfalfa		0	3.5	265	c
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Alfalfa		0	1.45	153	c w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Alfalfa		0	1.35	113	c w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Alfalfa		0	0.91	191	c w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Alfalfa		0	0.67	113	c w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Alfalfa		0	1.12	191	c w
Wagner-Riddle et al. (1997)	Guelph. Canada	Alfalfa		0	1.1	90	m
Wagner-Riddle et al. (1997)	Guelph. Canada	Alfalfa		0	0.8	365	m
Kaiser et al. (1998)	Braunschweig, Germany	Clover		0	0.96	960	c d
Simek et al. (2004)	Ceske Budejovice, Czech Republic	Clover		0	0.9	224	c 2-3w
Van der Weerden et al. (1999)	Canterbury, New Zealand	Clover		0	0.5	100	c
Ellert <sup>a</sup> mean	Lethbridge. Canada	Alfalfa		0	1.122	365	c
					1.8		
					1.3		
<i>B- Grass-legume forage stands</i>							
Simek et al. (2004)	Ceske Budejovice, Czech Republic	Grass-clover		0	0.9	224	c 2-3w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume		0	0.2	365	c d-w
Van der Weerden et al. (1999)	Canterbury, New Zealand	Grass-legumes		0	0.1	100	c
Wang et al. (1997)	Wagga Wagga, Australia	Ryegass-clover		0	0.2	245	c
Wang et al. (1997)	Wagga Wagga, Australia	Ryegass-clover		0	0.4	245	c
mean					0.4		
S.D.					0.3		
<i>C- Annual legume crops</i>							
Ellert <sup>a</sup>	Lethbridge, Canada	Fababean		0	0.412	365	c
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Lentil		5	0.04	226	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Lentil		5	0.11	250	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.38	239	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.74	239	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.45	225	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.38	225	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.45	238	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Three Hills, Canada	Peas		5	0.41	238	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Chickpea		5	0.06	226	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Chickpea		5	0.16	226	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Chickpea		5	0.04	250	c w
Lemke et al. (2003) <sup>a</sup>	Swift Current, Canada	Chickpea		5	0.03	250	c w
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	0.34	365	c 3d/21d
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	0.65	365	c 3d/21d
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	1.35	365	c 3d/21d
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	1.05	365	c 3d/21d

Table 1. Continued.

A- Pure legume forage stands								
Reference	Location	Crop	<sup>e</sup> Fertilizer type	N-rate (kg N ha <sup>-1</sup> )	N <sub>2</sub> O emission (kg N ha <sup>-1</sup> )	Length of exp. (d)	<sup>b</sup> Method	<sup>c</sup> Freq.
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	1.97	365	c	3d/21d
Bremner et al. (1980)	Iowa, USA	Soybeans		0	1.87	365	c	3d/21d
Chen et al. (2002)	Sheyang, China	Soybeans		0	0.6	124	c	w
Chen et al. (2002)	Sheyang, China	Soybeans		0	0.9	124	c	w
Gregorich <sup>a</sup>	Ottawa, Canada	Soybeans			1.15		c	
Gregorich <sup>a</sup>	Ottawa, Canada	Soybeans			1.51		c	
Gregorich <sup>a</sup>	Ottawa, Canada	Soybeans			0.29		c	
Gregorich <sup>a</sup>	Ottawa, Canada	Soybeans			0.42		c	
Jacinthe and Dick (1997)	Piketon, USA	Soybeans		0	1.18	120	c	2w
Jacinthe and Dick (1997)	Piketon, Ohio, USA	Soybeans		0	0.64	120	c	2w
Jacinthe and Dick (1997)	Piketon, USA	Soybeans		0	2.31	120	c	2w
Jacinthe and Dick (1997)	Piketon, USA	Soybeans		0	1.65	120	c	2w
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Soybeans			2.19		c	
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Soybeans			3.86		c	
MacKenzie et al. (1998)	Montréal, Canada	Soybeans			3.71		c	
Marinho et al. (2004)	Lousiana ,USA	Soybeans			1.16		c	
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Soybeans		0	0.46	153	c	w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Soybeans		0	0.7	88	c	w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Soybeans		0	1	115	c	w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Soybeans		0	0.5	88	c	w
Rochette et al. (2004)	Québec city Canada	Soybeans		0	0.55	115	c	w
Rochette <sup>a</sup>	Montréal, Canada	Soybeans			0.9		c	
Rochette <sup>a</sup>	Montréal, Canada	Soybeans			1.44		c	
Wagner-Riddle et al. (1997)	Guelph, Canada	Soybeans		0	1.6	365	m	d
Mean					1.0			
S.D.					0.9			
D- Situations with N inputs other than BNF								
Ellert <sup>a</sup>	Lethbridge, Canada	Alfalfa		133	1.186	365	c	
Conrad et al. (1983)	Mainz, Germany	Clover	SACl	100	0.07		c	d
Conrad et al. (1983)	Mainz, Germany	Clover	SN	100	0		c	d
Misselbrook et al. (1998)	SW England	Grass-clover	Pig slurry	223	0.684	60	c	1-7d
Misselbrook et al. (1998)	SW England	Grass-clover	Pig slurry	278	0.945	60	c	1-7d
Kaiser et al. (1998)	Braunschweig, Germany	Grass-clover	CAN + UAN	175	1.06	960	c	d
Williams et al. (1999)	Grange-over-Sands, UK	Grass-clover	U + AN	250	3.2	365	c	3-4d
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	40	0.4	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	40	0.8	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	80	1.2	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	80	0.8	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	120	1.4	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	240	2.8	365	c	d-w
Kammann et al. (1998)	Giessen, Germany	Grass-legume	CAN	400	4.3	365	c	d-w
Chen et al. (2000)	Sheyang, China	Soybeans	U	35	1.99	275	c	?
Whalen et al. (2000)	Sampson County, USA	Soybeans	Pig slurry	297	3.95	24	c	2-3 p.d.
Mean					1.5			
S.D.					1.3			

<sup>a</sup>cited by Helgason et al. (2005)H Fertilizer type: AN, ammonium nitrate; ACI, ammonium chloride; CAN, calcium ammonium nitrate; SN, sodium nitrate; U, urea; UAN, urea-ammonium nitrate. <sup>b</sup>c, closed chamber method; m, micrometeorological method. <sup>c</sup>Frequency, frequency of sampling; d, once per day; w, once per week; m, once per month; x d, once per x days; x p.d or x p.w, x times per day/week; x h, every x hours; cont, continuous; d/w or other combinations indicate higher frequency at high <sup>d</sup>flux from fertilized plot minus average flux from unfertilized situations, presented as a fraction of N-application. <sup>e</sup>flux from fertilized plot presented as a fraction of N-application.

(2004), in a preliminary report, found that two rhizobial strains (99A1 and RGP2) were unable to denitrify in pure cultures or in pea root nodules. Emissions of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  from inoculated lentil and pea were not greater than from non-inoculated plants or non-legume controls. Yang and Cai (2005) reported similar  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions from pots with or without growing soybean plants until the grain-filling stage. They concluded that the process of symbiotic N fixation *per se* does not stimulate  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  production. Further research is still merited, but we suggest that evidence to date for direct release of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  from BNF itself is inadequate to justify the universal adoption of this factor in global inventories of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emission.

Our observation does not imply that legume crops are not an important source of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$ ; indeed, highest  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions in Table 1 were from pure legume forage crops such as alfalfa. Several studies report increased  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions in legume forage crops. Legumes in humid tropical pastures increased average  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions by  $0.022 \text{ mg N m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$  compared to non-legume stands (Veldkamp et al. 1998); similar results were reported for legumes grown in a pot experiment with and without urea (Ghosh et al. 2002).

But we may not need to invoke  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  release during BNF to explain increased  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions under legumes. Thyme and Ambus (2004), who partitioned  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions from clover in a pot study by source, reported that “mineralization of dead clover tissues is most likely a more important source of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  than recently-fixed N”. Yang and Cai (2005) attributed increased emissions during the grain-filling stage of soybean plants to decomposition of the roots and nodules in the late growth stage. Similarly, Kilian and Werner (1996) observed that denitrification rates under N-fixing crops were correlated with soil nitrate levels; higher nitrate levels under N-fixing crops, presumably, arise from N deposition by N-fixing crops or from reduced scavenging of nitrate by the N-fixing crops. Denitrification might also be stimulated under legumes by greater release of available C (Wheatley et al. 1990; Bertelsen and Jensen 1992). Based on these findings, we propose that the increased  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  release associated with legume crops can be attributed largely to enhanced N release from decomposing leguminous residues, including roots and nodules.

Legumes can release substantial amounts of nitrogen to the soil (Ta et al. 1986; Khan et al.

2002a, b; Janzen et al. 2003). In productive systems, nitrogen allocated to roots may amount to as much as  $200 \text{ kg N ha}^{-1}$  or more (Walley et al. 1996; Kelner et al. 1997; Rasse et al. 1999; Vinther and Jensen 2000). Additional N is added via above-ground residues and by rhizodeposition (McNeill et al. 1997). For example, Mayer et al. (2003), from a pot study, reported that rhizodeposited N accounted for 13–16% of total plant N. Upon decomposition, these organic N sources can increase nitrate and ammonium concentrations in the soil (Hossain et al. 1996a, b; Gil and Fick 2001; Mayer et al. 2004; Rochette et al. 2004), if mineralization rates exceed plant N uptake, leading to high denitrification (Pu et al. 1999, 2001) and  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  production. By accounting fully for these nitrogen flows (and perhaps modifying current algorithms to reflect them), we may be able to reliably estimate the elevated  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions from legume crops, without resorting to poorly-understood processes of  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  release during N<sub>2</sub> fixation itself.

## Conclusion

In summary, there is little doubt that legumes can increase  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions, during growth (Kilian and Werner 1996) and especially after harvest (Bremner et al. 1980; Larsson et al. 1998; Rochette et al. 2004) or plowdown (Wagner-Riddle et al. 1997; Baggs et al. 2000; Millar et al. 2004). But field measurements indicate that much of this increase in emissions may be attributable to the N release from root exudates during the growing season and from decomposition of crop residues after harvest, rather than from BNF *per se*. This implies that  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emissions associated with the biological N fixation by legumes are smaller than previously estimated, and that, under field conditions, *Rhizobia* denitrification does not reduce significant amounts of nitrate or that  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  represents only a minor fraction of gaseous N products.

Field flux measurements and process-level laboratory studies offer little support for the use of an emission factor for BNF by legume crops equal to that for fertiliser N. Moreover, given the uncertainty regarding the direct role of *Rhizobia* in  $\text{N}_2\text{O}$  emission under field conditions, the inclusion of this mechanism into the IPCC methodology is hard to justify. Consequently, we propose that:

1. the biological fixation process itself be removed from the IPCC N<sub>2</sub>O inventory methodology;
2. N<sub>2</sub>O emissions induced by the growth of legume crops be estimated solely as a function of crop residue decomposition using an estimate of above- and below-ground residue inputs, modified as necessary to reflect recent findings on N allocation.

In our view, these changes would simplify calculation of N<sub>2</sub>O inventories, while acknowledging and capturing the important role of legumes as a potential source of N<sub>2</sub>O.

### Acknowledgements

We acknowledge with gratitude the insights and unpublished data provided by Reynald Lemke, Ben Ellert and Ed Gregorich. As well, we thank David Layzell for fruitful conversations about an earlier draft of this manuscript. This work was undertaken as a contribution to the IPCC process of revising the 1996 GHG inventory guidelines. Funding was provided, in part, by the ‘Model Farm’ program of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada.

### References

- Aoyama M. and Nozawa T. 1993. Microbial biomass nitrogen and mineralization-Immobilization processes of nitrogen in soils incubated with various organic materials. *Soil Sci. Plant Nutr.* 39: 23–32.
- Arrese-Igor C., Garcia-Plazaola J.I., Hernandez A. and Aparicio-Tejo P.M. 1990. Effect of low nitrate supply to nodulated Lucerne on time course of activities of enzymes involved in inorganic nitrogen metabolism. *Physiol. Plant* 80: 185–190.
- Baggs E.M., Rees R.M., Smith K.A. and Winten A.J.A. 2000. Nitrous oxide emission from soils after incorporating crop residues. *Soil Use Manage* 16: 82–87.
- Bertelsen F. and Jensen E.S. 1992. Gaseous nitrogen losses from field plots grown with pea (*Pisum sativum* L.) or spring barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.) estimated by <sup>15</sup>N mass balance and acetylene inhibition techniques. *Plant Soil* 174: 195–209.
- Bonish P.M., Steele K.W. and Neville F.J. 1991. Denitrifying and symbiotic characteristics of lotus rhizobia from two New Zealand soils. *N. Z. J. Agric. Res.* 34: 221–226.
- Bouwman A.F. 1996. Direct emissions of nitrous oxide from agricultural soils. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroenviron.* 46: 53–70.
- Bouwman A.F., Boumans L.J.M. and Batjes N.H. 2002a. Emissions of N<sub>2</sub>O and NO from fertilized fields: summary of available data. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 16: 1058doi:10.1029/2001GB001811. (Data available at: [http://arch.rivm.nl/ieweb/ieweb/index.html?databases/n2o\\_no\\_emission\\_inv.html](http://arch.rivm.nl/ieweb/ieweb/index.html?databases/n2o_no_emission_inv.html)).
- Bouwman A.F., Boumans L.J.M. and Batjes N.H. 2002b. Modeling global annual N<sub>2</sub>O and NO Emissions from fertilized fields. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 16: 1080doi:10.1029/2001GB001812.
- Bremner J.M., Robbins S.G. and Blackmer A.M. 1980. Seasonal variability in emission of nitrous oxide from soil. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 7: 641–644.
- Bryan B.A., Shearer G., Skeeters J.L. and Kohl D.H. 1985. Denitrification by intact soybean nodules in relation to natural <sup>15</sup>N enrichment of nodules. *Can. J. Soil Sci.* 65: 261–265.
- Breitenbeck G.A. and Bremner J.M. 1989. Ability of free-living *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* to denitrify nitrate in soils. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 7: 219–224.
- Chen G.X., Cabrera M.L., Zhang L., Wu J., Shi Y., Yu W.T. and Shen S.M. 2002. Nitrous oxide emissions from upland crop-soil systems in north eastern China. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroenviron.* 62: 241–247.
- Chen G.X., Huang B., Xu H., Zhang Y., Huang G.H., Yu K.W., Hou A.X., Du R., Han S.J. and vanCleemput O. 2000. Nitrous oxide emissions from terrestrial ecosystems in China. *Chemosphere Global Change Sci.* 2: 373–378.
- Conrad R., Seiler W. and Bunse G. 1983. Factors influencing the loss of fertilizer nitrogen in the atmosphere as N<sub>2</sub>O. *J. Geophys. Res.* 88: 6709–6718.
- Corre M.D., van Kessel C. and Pennock D.J. 1996. Landscape and seasonal patterns of nitrous oxide emissions in a semiarid region. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* 60: 1806–1815.
- Duxbury J.M., Bouldin D.R., Terry R.E. and Tate R.L. 1982. Emissions of nitrous oxide from soils. *Nature* 298: 462–464.
- Galloway J.N., Aber J.D., Erisman J.W., Seitzinger S.P., Howarth R.W., Cowling E.B. and Cosby B.J. 2003. The nitrogen cascade. *BioScience* 53: 341–356.
- Garcia-Plazaola J.I., Becerril J.M., Arrese-Igor C., Hernandez A., Gonzalez-Murua C. and Aparicio-Tejo P.M. 1993a. Denitrifying ability of thirteen *Rhizobium meliloti* strains. *Plant Soil* 149: 43–50.
- Garcia-Plazaola J.I., Becerril J.M., Arrese-Igor C., Hernandez A., Gonzalez-Murua C. and Aparicio-Tejo P.M. 1993b. The contribution of *Rhizobium meliloti* to soil denitrification. *Plant Soil* 157: 207–213.
- Garcia-Plazaola J. I., Arrese-Igor C., González A., Aparicio-Tejo P.M. and Becerril J.M. 1996. Denitrification in lucerne nodules is not involved in nitrite detoxification. *Plant Soil* 182: 149–155.
- Gil J.L. and Fick W.H. 2001. Soil nitrogen mineralization in mixtures of eastern gamagrass with alfalfa and red clover. *Agron. J.* 93: 902–910.
- Gregorich E.G., Rochette P., vandenBygaart A.J. and Angers D.A. 2005. Greenhouse gas contributions of agricultural soils and potential mitigation practices in Eastern Canada. *Soil. Till. Res.* (in press).
- Ghosh S., Majumdar D. and Jain M.C. 2002. Nitrous oxide emissions from *kharif* and *rabi* legumes grown on an alluvial soil. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 35: 473–478.
- Helgason B.L., Chantigny M.H., Drury C., Ellert B.H., Gregorich E.G., Janzen H.H., Lemke R.L., Pattey E., Rochette P. and Wagner-Riddle C. 2005. Toward improved coefficients

- for predicting direct N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from soil in Canadian agroecosystems. *Nutr. Cycl., Agroenviron.* (in press).
- Hossain S.A., Dalal R.C., Waring S.A., Strong W.M. and Weston E.J. 1996a. Comparison of legume-based cropping systems at Warra, Queensland. I. Soil nitrogen and organic carbon accretion and potentially mineralisable nitrogen. *Aust. J. Soil Res.* 34: 273–287.
- Hossain S.A., Strong W.M., Waring S.A., Dalal R.C. and Weston E.J. 1996b. Comparison of legume-based cropping systems at Warra, Queensland. II. Mineral nitrogen accumulation and availability to the subsequent wheat crop. *Aust. J. Soil Res.* 34: 289–297.
- Huang Y., Zou J., Zheng X., Wang Y. and Xu X. 2004. Nitrous oxide emissions as influenced by amendment of plant residues with different C:N ratios. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 36: 973–981.
- IPCC 1997. Greenhouse gas reference manual: revised 1996 IPCC guidelines for national greenhouse gas inventories. Reference Volume 3. J.T. Houghton, L.G. Meira Filho, B. Lin, K. Tréanton, . Mamaty, Y., Bondury, D.J. Briggs and B.A. Callander (eds). <http://www.ipcc-nccc.iges.or.jp/public/gl/invs6c.htm>.
- Jacinthe P.A. and Dick W.A. 1997. Soil Management and nitrous oxide emissions from cultivated fields in southern Ohio. *Soil Till. Res.* 41: 221–235.
- Janzen H.H., Beauchemin K.A., Bruinsma Y., Campbell C.A., Desjardins R.L., Ellert B.H. and Smith E.G. 2003. The fate of nitrogen in agroecosystems: An illustration using Canadian estimates. *Nutr. Cycling Agroecosyst.* 67: 85–102.
- Jenkinson D.A. 2001. The impact of humans on the nitrogen cycle, with focus on temperate arable agriculture. *Plant Soil* 228: 3–15.
- Kaiser E.-A., Kohrs K., Kucke M., Schnug E., Munch J.C. and Heinemeyer O. 1998. Nitrous oxide release from arable soil: importance of perennial forage crops. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 28: 36–43.
- Kammann C., Grunhage L., Muller C., Jacobi S. and Jager H.J. 1998. Seasonal variability and mitigation options for N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from differently managed grasslands. *Environ. Pollut.* 1(102): 179–186.
- Kelner D.J., Vessey J.K. and Entz M.H. 1997. The nitrogen dynamics of 1-, 2- and 3-year stands of alfalfa in a cropping system. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* 64: 1–10.
- Khan W.D.F., Peoples M.B. and Herridge D.F. 2002a. Quantifying below-ground nitrogen of legumes. 1. Optimizing procedures for <sup>15</sup>N shoot-labelling. *Plant Soil* 245: 327–334.
- Khan D.F., Peoples M.B., Chalk P.M. and Herridge D.F. 2002b. Quantifying below-ground nitrogen of legumes. 2. A comparison of <sup>15</sup>N and non isotopic methods. *Plant Soil* 239: 277–289.
- Kilian S. and Werner D. 1996. Enhanced denitrification in plots of N<sub>2</sub>-fixing faba beans compared to plots of a non-fixing legume and non-legumes. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 21: 77–83.
- Larsson L., Fern M., Kasimir-Klemedtsson Å. and Klemedtsson L. 1998. Ammonia and nitrous oxide emissions from grass and alfalfa mulches. *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosyst.* 51: 41–46.
- Lemke R.L., Goddard T.G. and Selles F. 2003. Quantifying nitrous oxide emissions resulting from the production of leguminous crops in western Canada. Final report submitted to Environment Canada, Ottawa, 27p.
- Lucinski R., Polcyn W. and Ratajczak L. 2002. Nitrate reduction and nitrogen fixation in symbiotic association Rhizobium-legumes. *Acta Biochim. Polon.* 49: 537–546.
- MacKenzie A.F., Fan M.X. and Cadrian F. 1998. Nitrous oxide emission in three years as affected by tillage, corn-soybean-alfalfa rotations, and nitrogen fertilization. *J. Environ. Qual.* 27: 698–703.
- Mayer J., Buegger F., Jensen E.S., Schloter M. and Heß J. 2003. Estimating N rhizodeposition of grain legumes using a <sup>15</sup>N in situ stem labelling method. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 35: 21–28.
- Mayer J., Buegger F., Jensen E.S., Schloter M. and Heß J. 2004. Turnover of grain legume N rhizodeposits and effect of rhizodeposition on the turnover of crop residues. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 39: 153–164.
- McNeill A.M., Zhu C. and Fillery I.R.P. 1997. Use of *in situ* <sup>15</sup>N-labelling to estimate the total below-ground nitrogen of pasture legumes in intact soil-plant systems. *Aust. J. Agric. Res.* 48: 295–304.
- Millar N., Ndifa J.K., Cadisch G. and Baggs E.M. 2004. Nitrous oxide emissions following incorporation of improved-fallow residues in the humid tropics. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 18. GB1032, doi:10.1029/2003GB002114.
- Misselbrook T.H., Chadwick D.R., Pain B.F. and Headon D.M. 1998. Dietary manipulation as a means of decreasing N losses and methane emissions and improving herbage uptake following application of pig slurry to grassland. *J. Agric. Sci.* 130: 183–191.
- Munns D.N. 1977. Mineral nutrition and the legume symbiosis. In: Hardy, R.W.F., and A.H. Gibson (eds.) *A treatise on dinitrogen fixation. Section IV, Agronomy and ecology*, pp. 353–392, Wiley, New York.
- O'Hara G.W., Daniel R.M., Steele K.W. and Bonish P.M. 1984. Nitrogen losses from soils caused by *Rhizobium*-dependent denitrification. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 16: 429–431.
- O'Hara G.W. and Daniel R.M. 1985. Rhizobial denitrification: a review. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 17: 1–9.
- Pu G., Saffigna P.G. and Strong W.M. 1999. Potential for denitrification in cereal soils of northern Australia after legume or grass-legume pastures. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 31: 667–675.
- Pu G., Strong W.M., Saffigna P.G. and Doughton J. 2001. Denitrification, leaching, and immobilisation of applied <sup>15</sup>N following legume and grass pastures in a semi-arid climate in Australia. *Nut. Cycling Agroecosyst.* 59: 199–207.
- Rasse D.P., Smucker A.J.M. and Schabenberger O. 1999. Modifications of soil nitrogen pools in response to alfalfa roots systems and shoot mulch. *Agron. J.* 91: 471–477.
- Robertson G.P., Paul E.A. and Harwood R.R. 2000. Greenhouse gases in intensive agriculture: contributions of individual gases to the radiative forcing of the atmosphere. *Science* 289: 1922–1925.
- Rochette P., Angers D.A., Bélanger G., Chantigny M.H., Prévost D. and Lévesque G. 2004. Emissions of N<sub>2</sub>O from alfalfa and soybeans crops in Eastern Canada. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* 68: 493–506.
- Rosen A., Lindgren P.-E. and Ljunggren H. 1996. Denitrification by *Rhizobium meliloti*. 1. Studies of free-living cells and nodulated plants. *Swed. J. Agric. Res.* 26: 105–113.
- Šimek M., Elhotová D., Klimeš F. and Hopkins D.W. 2004. Emissions of N<sub>2</sub>O and CO<sub>2</sub>, denitrification measurements

- and soil properties in red clover and rye grass stands. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 36: 9–21.
- Smil V. 2002a. Nitrogen and food production: proteins for human diets. *Ambio* 31: 126–131.
- Smil V. 2002b. The earth's biosphere. The MIT Press, Cambridge, pp 346.
- Smith G.B. and Smith M.S. 1986. Symbiotic and free-living denitrification by *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* 50: 349–354.
- Ta T.C., MacDowall F.D.H. and Faris M.A. 1986. Excretion of nitrogen assimilated from N<sub>2</sub> fixed by nodulated roots of alfalfa (*Medicago sativa*). *Can. J. Bot.* 64: 2063–2067.
- Thyne M. and Ambus P. 2004. N<sub>2</sub>O emission from grass-clover swards is largely unaffected by recently fixed N<sub>2</sub>. DAR-COFeNews No.1,(<http://www.darcof.dk/eneews/april04/emision.html>).
- van Berkum P. and Keyser H.H. 1985. Anaerobic growth and denitrification among different serogroups of soybean rhizobia. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 49: 772–777.
- der Weerden T.J., Sherlock R.R., Williams P.H. and Cameron K.C. 1999. Nitrous oxide emissions and methane oxidation by soil following cultivation of two different leguminous pastures. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 30: 52–60.
- Veldkamp E., Keller M. and Nuñez M. 1998. Effects of pasture management on N<sub>2</sub>O and NO emissions from soils in the humid tropics of Costa Rica. *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 12: 71–79.
- Velthof G.L., van Beusichem M.L. and Oenema O. 1998. Mitigation of nitrous oxide emissions from dairy farming systems. *Environ. Pollut.* 102: 173–178.
- Velthof G.L. and Oenema O. 1997. Nitrous oxide emission from dairy farming systems in the Netherlands. *Neth. J. Agric. Sci.* 45: 347–360.
- Vinther F.P. and Jensen E.S. 2000. Estimating legume N<sub>2</sub> fixation in grass-clover mixtures of a grazed organic cropping system using two <sup>15</sup>N methods. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* 78: 139–147.
- Wagner-Riddle C., Thurtell G.W., Kidd G.K., Beauchamp E.G. and Sweetman R. 1997. Estimates of nitrous oxide emissions from agricultural fields over 28 months. *Can. J. Soil Sci.* 77: 135–144.
- Walley F.L., Tomm G.O., Matus A., Slinkard A.E. and van Kessel C. 1996. Allocation and cycling of nitrogen in an alfalfa-bromegrass sward. *Agron. J.* 88: 834–843.
- Wang Y.-P., Meyer C.P., Galbally I.E. and Smith C.J. 1997. Comparisons of field measurements of carbon dioxide and nitrous oxide fluxes with model simulations for a legume pasture in southern Australia. *J. Geophys. Res.* 102: 28013–28024.
- Whalen S.C., Phillips R.L. and Fisher E.N. 2000. Nitrous oxide emission from an agricultural field fertilized with liquid lagoon swine effluent. *Global Biogeochem. Cycl.* 14: 545–558.
- Wheatley R., Ritz K. and Griffiths B. 1990. Microbial biomass and mineral N transformations in soil planted with barley, ryegrass or turnip. *Plant Soil* 127: 157–167.
- Williams D.L., Ineson P. and Coward P.A. 1999. Temporal variations in nitrous oxide fluxes from urine-affected grassland. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 31: 779–788.
- Yang L. and Cai Z. 2005. The effect of growing soybean (*Glycine max* L.) on N<sub>2</sub>O emission from soil. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 37: 1205–1209.
- Yang X.M., Drury C.F., Reynolds W.D., McKenney D.J., Tan C.S., Zhang T.Q. and Fleming R.J. 2002. Influence of composts and liquid pig manure on CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from a clay loam soil. *Can. J. Soil Sci.* 82: 395–401.
- Zhong Z., Lemke R.L. and Nelson L.M. 2004. Quantifying the N<sub>2</sub>O emissions associated with N<sub>2</sub> fixation by pulse crops. Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, Ottawa Annual report to the BGSS program.